

**ARMS EXPORTS AND TRANSFERS:  
EUROPE TO AFRICA,  
BY COUNTRY**

**December 2010**

**Study realized by Africa Europe Faith and Justice Network – AEFJN**



# ARMS EXPORTS AND TRANSFERS: EUROPE TO AFRICA, BY COUNTRY

## 1. General overview

Selling and transferring arms to the African market is a very profitable endeavor for many European countries and companies. For example, Russia, the second largest arms exporter after the United States, sent 14% of its arms and weapons exports for 2005-2009 to Africa, its second largest market. In the same time period, German arms exports to Africa increased by 100% from 2000-2004, and French exports increased by 30%. It is important to note that a majority of the defense materials, aircraft, and vehicles that are sent to Africa are refurbished or second-hand; many are remnants of Cold War era militarization, particularly the arms from Eastern European countries such as Ukraine.

During the period 2005-2009, South Africa and the North African countries of Algeria, Morocco, Libya, and to a lesser extent, Egypt and Tunisia, are the largest arms importers in Africa. There is a definite trend indicating an ominous North African arms race with Algeria at the forefront. And while the exports from Europe to Sub-Saharan Africa are not nearly comparable in scope or scale as their northern neighbors, SIPRI reports that “in several cases, relatively small volumes of arms supplies to Sub-Saharan African countries have had a major impact on regional conflict dynamics.” The issue of exporting arms to a country only to have them redistributed to conflict zones is very real and highlights the importance of verifying end-user. Arms and military equipment delivered to Chad are often diverted to the conflict in Darfur, and in 2009, tanks were exported to Kenya even though there was a strong indication that the intended end-user was actually the Government of Southern Sudan. Some European countries knowingly exported, transferred, or brokered arms deals for countries that have been under an international arms embargo for all or part of the period between 2005 and 2009. These embargoed-yet-recipient countries include: the Democratic Republic of Congo, Côte d’Ivoire, Eritrea, Liberia, Libya, Sierra Leone, the Darfur region of Sudan, and Somalia. In spite of the fact that it has been under embargo since 1992, Poland, Lithuania, Italy, Kazakhstan, and private weapons dealers have violated the embargo and exported arms to Somalia between 2005 and 2009, according to the Ploughshares Fund. The result has been a militarization of the African continent. For example, the Government of Sudan is using its 60% of its oil revenue to purchase foreign weapons and build up its own domestic arms industry. Arms exports to Africa have also led to stockpiles of excess weapons that continue to be circulated throughout the continent.

The intent of this report is to track the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW), as well as other conventional weapons and military equipment, from Europe to Africa between the years of 2005 and 2009 by consolidating the information made available by both national governments and think tanks. Consequently, a lack of transparency regarding arms sales or a lack of accessibility to the information will affect the comprehensiveness of the data for any given country. Additionally, there are sometimes discrepancies between what is officially reported by the government ministries in their national reports and what is reported by the arms-control think tanks such as Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI) and Group for Research and Information on Peace and Security (GRIP). There are also several cases in which “unspecified amounts” of arms have been exported to a given country or very nominal amounts of small arms and light weapons have been officially reported, such as one (1) pistol. Both instances suggest either a discrepancy between sources or questionable, incomplete, or opaque reporting. For the purposes of this report, both European Union and non-European Union members of Europe were observed. Similarly, data on arms exports and transfers to Sub-Saharan Africa and North Africa was utilized.

## 2. European Union Member States

### 2.1. AUSTRIA

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### 2.2. BELGIUM

As Tables 1.1, 1.2, 1.3, and 1.4 indicate, the fractured political and economic structure of Belgium makes it difficult to cohesively track Belgian weapons exports to Africa. The complexity has allowed Belgian companies and government structures more flexibility to circumvent national and European Union regulations in the name of profit. For example, in 2009, the government of Wallonia illegally brokered a massive, €111 million deal for arms to be delivered to Libya, who was under an international embargo at the time. According to IANSA, the domestic and regional reaction to the controversial deal was immediate, especially given Libya's poor human rights record and its support of armed rebellions throughout Africa. Belgium, and specifically the Walloon government, was reprimanded by EU officials, civil society, and human rights organizations alike given its unique interpretation of the binding EU Common Position on Arms Exports and inability to verify Libya's end-use certificates. Another example of this weakness in the Belgian arms export system is Chad. Between 2006 and 2008, 82 armored cars with cannons were exported to Chad by a Belgian company. However, the equipment was sold via France, and the Belgian company claimed to not know that Chad, a country that has been funneling arms to Darfur and engaged in a civil war of its own, would be the final recipient.

Table 1.1: Value of National Weapons Export Licenses from Belgium (in Euros) from 2005-2009

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Benin	2007	€2,704,000
	2008	€840,000
Burundi	2006	€161,000
	2008	€149,456
Democratic Republic of Congo	2006	€4,555,382
	2009	€136,504,961
Morocco	2008	€2,700,000
	2009	€318,350

Table 1.2: Value of Weapons Export Licenses from Wallonia (in Euros) from 2005-2009

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Algeria	2007	€41,616
	2008	€2,105,945
Botswana	2006	€449,000
Burkina Faso	2008	€2,500

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Cameroon	2007	€4,248
Democratic Republic of Congo	2008	€2,753,690
Egypt	2006	€80,000
	2007	€10,701,504
	2008	€36,470,914
Ethiopia	2008	€132,949
Ghana	2007	€1,635
Madagascar	2007	€200
Mauritania	2006	€5,879,515
	2007	€107,892
Morocco	2006	€1,322,218
	2007	€33,715,630
	2008	€19,550,000
Namibia	2008	€4,000
Nigeria	2007	€2,965,425
Senegal	2007	€16,226
	2008	€2,953,832
South Africa	2007	€3,281,200
Tunisia	2006	€354,609
	2007	€182,900

Table 1.3: Value of Weapons Export Licenses from the Brussels-Capital Region (in Euros) from 2005-2009

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Algeria	2005	€47,960
Burkina Faso	2005	€4,200
	2008	€1,250
Cameroon	2005	€1,400
	2006	€1,129,183
Ghana	2006	€26,194
Libya	2008	€446,032
Morocco	2006	€1,427,123
	2008	€116,400
Tanzania	2006	€12,476

Table 1.4: Value of Weapons Export Licenses from Flanders (in Euros) from 2005-2009

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Algeria	2005	€79,181
Democratic Republic of Congo	2007	€84,491
Morocco	2005	€58,188
South Africa	2005	€6,710
	2008	€13,500
	2009	€6,662,100
Zambia	2005	€120,000

### 2.3. BULGARIA

Although official reports of Bulgarian arms exports have only recently begun to be published, there is some information about deals between 2005 and 2007. For example, in 2006, Bulgaria sold SALW and ammunition to Burkina Faso (€173,243), Algeria (€31,827), and Chad (€208,125). In 2007, Bulgaria exported 114 light weapons to Ethiopia and sent 20 armored personnel carriers and 2 combat helicopters to Mali. Rwanda received 5000 rifles and 76,500kg of small arms ammunition in 2005, and Uganda has received an unspecified amount of weapons from Bulgaria during this entire 3 year period.

### 2.4. CYPRUS

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### 2.5. CZECH REPUBLIC

In 2006, the Czech Republic represented more than half of all EU military equipment exports to Mali (100%), Zambia (97.6%), Libya (96.4%), and Nigeria (57.58%). It also had a major share of EU exports to Ethiopia (36.2%) and Tunisia (13.7%).

Table 1.5: Value of Military Equipment Exported from the Czech Republic (in Euros) from 2005-2008

COUNTRY	2005	2006	2007	2008
Algeria	€2,265,000	€2,213,000	€9,339,000	€17,221,000
Angola	€304,000	-	-	-
Cameroon	-	-	-	€106,000
Cape Verde	€5,000	-	€2,000	€4,000
Chad	€3,000	-	-	-
Equatorial Guinea	-	-	€2,030,000	-
Ethiopia	€839,000	€1,015,000	€7,334,000	€2,432,000

COUNTRY	2005	2006	2007	2008
Ghana	-	-	€135,000	-
Libya	-	€712,000	€2,233,000	€383,000
Madagascar	-	-	€37,000	-
Mali	€422,000	€3,000	-	-
Morocco	€362,000	-	-	-
Nigeria	€110,000	€539,000	€1,736,000	€6,532,000
South Africa	-	-	€160,000	€26,000
Sudan	-	-	-	€294,000
Tunisia	€843,000	€4,171,000	€3,078,000	€187,000
Zambia	-	€24,000	-	€45,000*

\*Licenses were granted, but the military equipment was not exported in this year.

## 2.6. DENMARK

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

## 2.7. ESTONIA

Table 1.6: Value of Export Licenses for Military Goods from Estonia from 2005-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Angola	2008	1,419,960 (in EUR)*
Namibia	2006	10,176,000 (in EEK)*
	2008	122,030 (in EUR)
South Africa	2005	6,152,800 (in EEK)*
	2008	18,900 (in USD)

\* This deal involved at least 2 other countries.

## 2.8. FINLAND

According to Table 1.7, most of Finland's arms and defense material exports to conflict zones such as Somalia, Liberia, Uganda and Sudan are only for peacekeeping purposes. Even countries such as Kenya that are relatively stable themselves yet engage in the destructive redistribution of arms to conflict areas do not receive any SALW or conventional arms for non-protective purposes. Finland is one of the more responsible European countries in terms of the ethics of exporting arms.

Table 1.7: Value of Defense Material Exports from Finland (in Euros) from 2005-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPE OF MATERIAL
---------	------	-------	------------------

Algeria	2005	€6,190	not listed
	2008	€71,250	not listed
Botswana	2008	€20,000	not listed
Democratic Republic of Congo	2005*	€16,566	protective equipment
	2006*	€5,400	not listed
Egypt	2005	€79,800	smooth-bore weapons and components
	2006	€1,594,663	smooth bore weapons, protective equipment;
	2007	€126,160	protective equipment
	2008	€32,000	smooth-bore weapons and components
Ethiopia	2005*	€9,885	protective equipment
	2007	€23,430	electronic equipment specifically for military use
Kenya	2005*	€13180	protective equipment
Liberia	2005*	€9970	protective equipment
Mauritius	2006	€5116	not listed
Morocco	2005	€1191380	military electronics and components
Somalia	2005*	€26190	protective equipment
South Africa	2005	€16666	ammunition; shots; components
	2006	€72370	ammunition shots; military electronics; components of both
	2007	€250000	not listed
	2008	€117873	sniper rifles and accessories, ammunition, shots, components; electronic equipment for military use
Sudan	2005*	€47525	protective equipment
Uganda	2005*	€3954	protective equipment
	2006*	€130443	protective equipment

\* For UN Purposes.

## 2.9. FRANCE

It is apparent from both Tables 1.8 and 1.9 that France is a major contributor to the North African arms race. However, there are several major deals have not yet been reflected in French export data which further implicates its responsibility. For example, in 2008, France made two separate deals worth €470

million and €350 million each. These deals include the transfer of warships, anti-satellite missiles, combat aircraft, aircraft radar, and beyond visual range missiles. In 2007, France made a deal worth €218 million to send anti-tank missiles to Libya.

France, like many other European countries, can also be a negligent exporter of arms. In 2006, for example, the World Bank froze Chadian accounts because the government used oil revenue for weapons purchases instead of poverty reduction and development as it was required to do so. While other countries such as Germany and Bosnia denied licenses for arms exports to Chad, France continued to supply the country with various arms and the means to acquire them in spite of Chad's egregious human rights record.

Table 1.8: Value and/or Types of Small Arms and Light Weapons Exports from France from 2005-2008, By Country

<b>COUNTRY</b>	<b>YEAR</b>	<b>VALUE (in Euros)/ TYPES OF MATERIALS</b>
Algeria	2007	€36,300,000
Angola	2007	€2,300,000
Benin	2006	2500 grenade launchers
	2008	€400,000
Botswana	2005	80 missiles
Burkina Faso	2008	€100,000
Cameroon	2005	26 automatic rifles, 11420 grenade launchers, 20 armored vehicles
	2006	10780 grenade launchers
	2007	€500,000
	2008	€800,000
Chad	2006	€100,000; including 23 rifles
	2007	€5,400,000; 45 machine guns, 40 armored vehicles
	2008	€8,800,000; 25 armored vehicles, anti-tank missiles
Democratic Republic of Congo*	2005	1 semi-automatic rifle
	2006	1 semiautomatic weapon
Djibouti	2005	1990 grenade launchers
	2006	1990 grenade launchers
	2007	€300,000
Ethiopia	2007	€2,000,000
	2008	€500,000
Gabon	2007	€300,000
	2008	€400,000
Guinea	2006	500 grenade launchers
Kenya	2007	€6,400,000
	2008	€14,500,000

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE (in Euros)/ TYPES OF MATERIALS
Libya	2007	€15,500,000
Malawi	2007	€200,000
	2008	€100,000
Mali	2007	€200,000
Mauritania	2005	1 automatic rifle; 1050 grenade launchers
	2008	€300,000
Mauritius	2005	400 grenade launchers
	2006	400 grenade launchers
	2007	€100,000
	2008	€100,000
Morocco	2006	1 automatic rifle, 3050 grenade launchers
	2007	€25,500,000
Niger	2008	€500,000
Nigeria	2005	18 semi-automatic rifles
	2006	18 automatic rifles
	2007	€6,000,000
	2008	€14,600,000
Senegal	2006	1 light helicopter, 2 trainer aircrafts, 150 pistol/revolvers
South Africa	2006	8 automatic rifles, 102 grenade launchers
	2007	€15,000,000
	2008	€34,000,000
Tunisia	2005	85 guns, 200 grenade launchers, 40 missiles
	2006	85 guns, 200 grenade launchers, 20 missiles
	2007	€2,500,000
Uganda	2008	€1,000,000

\* It is also reported that the Democratic Republic of Congo has received additional, yet unspecified amounts of arms from France during this period.

Table 1.9: Value of Small Arms and Light Weapons Exports from France (in Euros) from 2005-2008, By Region

REGION	YEAR	VALUE
North Africa (except Egypt)	2005	25.3M€
	2006	66M€
	2007	79.7M€

REGION	YEAR	VALUE
	2008	97.2M€
Sub-Saharan Africa	2005	94.5M€
	2006	15.8M€
	2007	38.7M€
	2008	75.4M

## 2.10. GERMANY

In addition to the weapons exports reported in Table 1.10, Germany transferred an unspecified amount of weapons to the Republic of Congo (including 3 helicopters in 2007). Reportedly, Germany also negotiated a €34 million arms deal with Tunisia in 2005.

Table 1.10: Value of Weapons Exports from Germany (in Euros) from 2005-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Burundi	2005	€21,219
Côte d'Ivoire	2005	€39,886
Democratic Republic of Congo	2008**	€19,175
Egypt	2005	€1,350
	2008*	€24,673
Liberia	2005	€36,763
South Africa	2005	€90,263
	2006	€242,313
Sudan	2005	€32,483

\*Components for small machine guns

\*\*Ammunition

## 2.11. GREECE

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

## 2.12. HUNGARY

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### **2.13. IRELAND**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### **2.14. ITALY**

In addition to the data included in Table 1.11, Italy has exported defense materials to Cameroon, Morocco, Somalia, and Nigeria. In 2007, Italy sent 90 rifles to Cameroon, per UNROCA. Between 2007 and 2008, Italy exported 2 pistol/revolvers, 2117 rifles, 3 naval guns to Morocco, in addition to a €130 million deal for military aircraft. Nigeria received 4 light helicopters, 1 transport aircraft, 2 helicopters, and 2 maritime patrol aircraft as part of a €60 million deal made with Italy in 2006. Libya also imported 10 light helicopters between 2006 and 2007.

Table 1.11: Value of Weapons Exports from Italy (in Euros) in 2008

<b>COUNTRY</b>	<b>YEAR</b>	<b>VALUE</b>
Algeria	2008	€77,570,000
Libya	2008	€93,220,000

### **2.15. LATVIA**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### **2.16. LITHUANIA**

SIPRI reports indicate that between 2005 and 2009, Lithuania has exported an unspecified amount of arms to Somalia despite the fact that it has been under embargo since 1992.

### **2.17. LUXEMBOURG**

It is reported that Luxembourg sent one (1) light armed transport for maritime use to Senegal in 2007.

### **2.18. MALTA**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

## 2.19. THE NETHERLANDS

Although the contents of the deal are not indicated in Table 1.12, the Netherlands made a deal with Morocco in 2008, worth €510 million, for military goods including warships. Already a major supplier of arms to Tunisia and especially Egypt, military exports from The Netherlands is fueling the North African arms race further.

Table 1.12: Value of Defense Material Exports from the Netherlands (in Euros) from 2005-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPE OF MATERIAL
Cameroon	2006	€70,000	military electronics
Egypt	2005	€40,360,000	armored vehicles, guided missiles, military electronics
	2006	€290,000	parts and components for "other military goods"
	2007	€14,690,000	military electronics, parts and components for "other military goods"
	2008	€3,390,000	parts and components for "arms and munitions," military technology and software, parts and components for "other military goods"
Morocco	2005	€180,000	parts and components for "other military goods," military electronics
	2006	€40,000	military electronics
Rwanda	2005	€170,000	other military equipment
	2008	€160,000	other military equipment
South Africa	2006	€10,000	military technology and software
	2007	€4,150,000	military electronics, military technology and software, armor-plating and protective equipment
	2008	€240,000	parts and components for "other military goods"
Sudan	2006*	€560,000	military auxiliary and production equipment
Tanzania	2006	€90,000	military auxiliary and production equipment
Tunisia	2005	€1,040,000	military electronics
	2006	€50,000	parts and components for "other military goods"
	2007	€20,000	parts and components for

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPE OF MATERIAL
			"arms and munitions"
Uganda	2006*	€290,000	military auxiliary and production equipment

\*intended for UNHCR use.

## 2.20. POLAND

Although information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) from Poland to Africa was not readily accessible, several think tanks report that it has been transferring unspecified types and amounts of weapons to Uganda, Nigeria, the Democratic Republic of Congo, and Somalia.

## 2.21. PORTUGAL

Compared to many of its European counterparts, Portugal is not a major exporter of arms to Africa. However, Table 1.13 indicates that it has exported sizeable amounts of arms to Niger, a country that recently underwent a coup d'état, and to Angola and Chad, two of the most unstable, conflict-prone countries on the continent. Additionally, its other three most significant recipients are the North African countries of Tunisia, Morocco, and Libya.

Table 1.13: Defense Material Exports from Portugal from 2007-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE OF EXPORT (in Euros)
Angola	2007	€1,214,405
	2008	€54,073
Cape Verde	2007	€14,918
Chad	2007	€609,843
	2008	€452,333
Gabon	2007	€194,830
	2008	€97,000
Equatorial Guinea	2008	€170,000
Libya	2008	€512,217
Morocco	2007	€122,843
	2008	€21,212
Niger	2008	€913,190
Nigeria	2008	€34,013
Tunisia	2008	€1,372,488

## 2.22. ROMANIA

According to Table 1.14, in 2006 Romania attempted, albeit unsuccessfully, to export arms to the embargoed country of Eritrea and to the redistributing Chad. Romania was far more successful in its transactions with Liberia, which until recently has been very volatile, and Rwanda perhaps due to the end-user specification of government forces.

Table 1.14: Defense Material Exports from Romania from 2006-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	AMOUNT AND/OR TYPES OF MATERIALS
Angola	2007	components for military transport helicopter
Burkina Faso	2006	400 submachine guns (worth €85,200), SA ammunition, antitank grenade launchers (worth €902,920), anti tank ammunition
	2008	800 submachine guns, 205 assault rifles, antitank grenades, small arms ammo, defensive hand grenade, 10 grenade launchers
Cameroon	2008	1 transport military helicopter
Chad	2006	deal but no exports listed
Egypt	2006	components for grenade launcher ammo, components for military aero-engine, technical documentation for aero-engine test
	2007	military combat aero-engine, components for military combat aircraft
	2008	aero-engine for military combat aircraft
Eritrea	2006	deal but no exports listed
Ethiopia	2006	equipment for military training helicopter, technical documentation for military training aircraft
	2008	deal but no exports listed
Gabon	2006	small arms ammunition (worth €137,499)
	2008	deal for helicopter but no exports listed
Liberia	2006	100 submachine guns, small arms ammo; for use by governmental forces
	2007	957 submachine guns, accessories for small arms, 100 antitank grenades launcher, small arms ammo; all only for government forces
	2008	deal for 250 pistols, 500 submachine guns, 100 assault rifles, 50 antitank grenades, small arms ammo, but no exports listed
Mauritius	2006	equipment for military transport helicopter
Rwanda	2006	licenses for 2000 sniper rifles and small arms ammo, for use by governmental forces
	2007	50 semi-automatic rifles, 2010 submachine guns, small arms ammo
Senegal	2006-2007	small arms ammo (worth €21,831)
South Africa	2006	equipment for military transport helicopter
Uganda	2006	components for aviation bomb

## 2.23. SLOVAKIA

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

## 2.24. SLOVENIA

During the period of 2006-2009, Slovenia exported military equipment to only two African countries: Egypt and Libya. In 2006, Slovenia exported defense materials to Egypt whose value equaled €933,174. In 2008 and 2009, Egypt received Slovenian military equipment worth €165,231 and €79,005, respectively. Slovenia's transactions with Libya include a deal for aircraft valued at €274,860.

## 2.25. SPAIN

"According to the SIPRI Yearbook, Spain ranked sixth among world arms exporters in 2008 comparing with the eighth position it achieved the former year. It ranked following the US, the Russian Federation, Germany, France, and the UK...Furthermore, it is the highest volume in its history for the third year in a row." In addition to the information included in Table 1.15, Spain exported 6 military transport aircraft to Algeria in 2005 and 2006, in spite of concerns about its human rights record. In 2006, Spain also sold an unspecified amount of small arms and light weapons worth €900 to Cameroon.

Table 1.15: Total Value of Defense Materials Exported from Spain (in Euros) Between 2005 and 2008

COUNTRY	DEFENSE MATERIAL	ARMS/AMMUNITIONS/ PARTS/ACCESSORIES
Angola		€2,231,410
Botswana		€71,580
Cameroon	€1,800	€472,780
Burkina Faso		€611,180
Central African Republic		€876,430
Chad		€24,030
Egypt	€2,007,000	€238,810
Equatorial Guinea	€14,560	€326,900
Gabon		€192,990
Ghana		€13,174,670
Guinea		€4,298,270
Guinea Bissau	€3,420	€2,568,260
Kenya	€162,880	
Libya	€25,950	€86,710
Mali		€1,010,190
Mauritania	€300	€939,100
Morocco	€151,087,890	€4,855,650
Namibia		€763,580
Senegal	€390	€532,110

COUNTRY	DEFENSE MATERIAL	ARMS/AMMUNITIONS/ PARTS/ACCESSORIES
South Africa	€505,500	€5,459,150
Tanzania	€12,000	- €118,950
Tunisia	€368,000	€451,410
Uganda		€3,300

## 2.26. SWEDEN

As Table 1.16 shows, Sweden has been exporting massive amounts of SALW, conventional weapons, and equipment to South Africa during the period between 2005 and 2008, a combined value of nearly 10 billion Swedish Kronor (SEK). Exports to Algeria come in at a very distant second at a value of nearly 40 million SEK. This is troublesome because not only does South Africa have its own very high violence rates, it is also the primary intra-continental exporter of arms in Africa. Such large transactions have major implications on the redistribution of arms to conflict zones and embargoed areas by increasing the stockpile of excess arms and further accelerating the militarization of the continent.

Table 1.16: Total Value and Types of Military Equipment Exported from Sweden (in SEK) Between 2005 and 2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPES OF MATERIALS
Algeria	2008*	39,500,000 SEK	biological/nuclear
Egypt	2006	12,200,000 SEK	description unavailable
	2007	10,000 SEK	rifles, automatic weapons
	2008*	6,800,000 SEK	description unavailable
Mauritius	2005	50,000 SEK	ammunition
	2006	60,000 SEK	ammunition
	2007	10,000 SEK	ammunition
Namibia	2005	300,000 SEK	ammunition
	2006	600,000 SEK	ammunition
	2007	100,000 SEK	ammunition
	2008	600,000 SEK	SALW ammunition
South Africa	2005	1,200,000,000 SEK	SALW ammunition, weapons system for combat, rifles and automatic weapons, combat vehicles, warships,
	2006	1,862,000,000 SEK	SALW ammunition, weapons system for combat, rifles and automatic weapons, combat vehicles, warships,
	2007	1,333,500,000 SEK	SALW ammunition, weapons system for combat, rifles and automatic weapons, combat vehicles,

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPES OF MATERIALS
			warships,
	2008	1,901,000,000 SEK	SALW ammunition, weapons system for combat, rifles and automatic weapons, combat vehicles, warships,
Tanzania	2008	1,100,000 SEK	SALW ammunition
Tunisia	2005	3,200,000 SEK	weapons system for combat
	2006	2,500,000 SEK	weapons system for combat; missiles, rockets, grenades
	2008	1,000,000 SEK	warship/vessel

\*License was granted, but military equipment does not appear to have been shipped.

## 2.27. UNITED KINGDOM

According to Table 1.17, the United Kingdom exported weapons valued at £27083 to Uganda in 2006. However, SIPRI reports that British defense companies are using South African subsidiaries, for example, to circumvent national and European Union laws preventing the export of arms to conflict-prone areas. This implies that the amount of exports is actually higher than what's reported.

Table 1.17: Total Amount of SALW and Value (in GBP) of Conventional Weapons Exported from the United Kingdom Between 2005 and 2008

COUNTRY	YEAR	AMOUNT: SALW	VALUE: CONVENTIONAL WEAPONS (in GBP)
Algeria	2005		£4500
	2006		£7117
	2007		£41826
Angola	2006		£352910
	2007		£333808
Botswana	2005		£2275463
	2006		£28326
	2007	150 items	£1677153
Burundi	2007	1 item	£680
Cape Verde	2006		£41583
	2007		£28685
Dem. Rep. of Congo	2007		£3000
Djibouti	2006		£141025
	2007		£52605

<b>COUNTRY</b>	<b>YEAR</b>	<b>AMOUNT: SALW</b>	<b>VALUE: CONVENTIONAL WEAPONS (in GBP)</b>
Egypt	2005		£6332964
	2006		£8413219
	2007		£11461369
Ethiopia	2006		£236471
	2007		£50105
Gabon	2005		£3313
	2006		£4545
	2007		£18735
Gambia	2008	3 items	
Ghana	2006		£24800
Kenya	2005	2 items	£573180
	2006	14 items	£10912685
	2007	6 items	£1452260
	2008	11 items	
Lesotho	2006	40 items	£22878
	2007		£14723
	2008	202 items	
Liberia	2006		£26939
Libya	2006		£11378
	2007		£64847
	2008	2 items	
Malawi	2006		£22000
Mali	2007		£45133
Mauritania	2006		£1194
Mauritius	2006		£15829
	2007		£360008
Morocco	2005		£9657
	2006		£107259
	2007	6 items	£93971
	2008	187 items	
Mozambique	2006		£11500
Namibia	2008	5 items	
Nigeria	2005		£530600
	2006		£270447

COUNTRY	YEAR	AMOUNT: SALW	VALUE: CONVENTIONAL WEAPONS (in GBP)
	2007		£608391
Senegal	2005		£21012
	2006		£223414
	2007		£55093
Seychelles	2006		£16781
	2007		£73425
Sierra Leone	2005		£171750
South Africa	2005	745 items	£25657629
	2006	17 items	£10924514
	2007	21 items	£38732727
	2008	284 items	
Sudan	2007		£89369
Swaziland	2005	2 items	£1790
	2006		£1645
	2007		£2768
Tanzania	2005	1 item	£1695
	2007		£72223
	2008	3 items	
Togo	2006		£1956
Tunisia	2005		£3936
	2006		£343335
	2007		£338163
	2008	4 items	
Uganda	2006		£27083
Zambia	2006	149 items	£25498
	2007		£2223
	2008	72 items	

### 3. Non-European Union Member States

#### 3.1. ALBANIA

In the official government reports for arms exports, there were no exports from Albania to Africa recorded between 2007 and 2008.

### **3.2. BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA**

Table 2.1: Value of Defense Material Exports from Bosnia and Herzegovina (in Euros) from 2007-2008

<b>COUNTRY</b>	<b>YEAR</b>	<b>VALUE</b>	<b>TYPE OF MATERIAL</b>
Egypt	2007	€165,380	ammunition and weapons
	2008	€6,203,312	unspecified
Libya	2006	€1,396,380	unspecified
	2007	€1,887,000	Technologies

### **3.3. BELARUS**

It has been very difficult to track the arms transferred from Belarus to the African continent. Several think tanks report that Belarus has been shipping unspecified amounts of defense materials to the governments of Algeria, Uganda, Ethiopia, and Sudan. There are also unconfirmed reports that Côte d'Ivoire has received at least 4 ground attack aircraft.

### **3.4. CROATIA**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### **3.5. GEORGIA**

In the period of 2005-2009, Georgia transferred an unspecified amount of arms to the Democratic Republic of Congo.

### **3.6. ICELAND**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### **3.7. KAZAKHSTAN**

Although information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) from Kazakhstan to Africa was not readily accessible, several think tanks report that it has been transferring unspecified types and amounts of weapons to Ethiopia, Sudan, and Somalia.

### **3.8. KOSOVO**

Information about the export of small arms and light weapons (SALW) and other conventional weapons from this European country to the countries of Africa during the period of 2005-2009 was not readily accessible.

### 3.9. FYR MACEDONIA

In the official government reports for arms exports, there were no exports to Africa recorded between 2005 and 2007.

### 3.10. MONTENEGRO

Table 2.2: Total Value of Defense Material Exports from Montenegro from 2006-2008

COUNTRY	VALUE	TYPE OF MATERIAL
Egypt	71,500 (in EUR)	65 pieces of driving fuel for jet aircrafts PZ-M
Libya	134,190 (in USD)	71 sets of pyrotechnical cartridges
Seychelles	< 1,000,000 (in EUR)	Not Listed

\*Note: No exports to Africa were recorded in 2007.

### 3.11. NORWAY

Egypt seems to be the biggest beneficiary of non-EU member arms exports amongst the North African countries. In addition to the significant exports from Norway, according to Table 2.3, Egypt has been importing heavily from Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, Serbia, and Switzerland.

Table 2.3: Value of Defense Material Exports from Norway (in Norwegian Kroner) from 2005-2007

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Egypt	2005	11,318,000 NOK
	2006	11,157,000 NOK
South Africa	2005	1,260,000 NOK
	2006	2,122,000 NOK
	2007	1,785,000 NOK
Tanzania	2005	1,000 NOK
	2007	2,000 NOK

### 3.12. RUSSIA

Although it is second only to the United States in terms of international arms exports, it is quite difficult to find comprehensive or readily available data on Russian arms transfers to African countries during the period of 2005 to 2009. Think tanks report that Russia has sent unspecified amounts of weapons to Ethiopia, Nigeria, Uganda, Sudan, and Eritrea while it was under embargo. It has also exported combat helicopters to both Burkina Faso and Senegal in 2005 and 2007.

More importantly, perhaps, Russia is a major contributor to the ongoing arms race in North Africa. Between 2005 and 2008, Russia made a deal worth \$250 million (USD) for developing an air defense system in Morocco, a deal which included at least 300 surface-to-air missiles. In 2006, Russia made a major deal with Algeria, worth \$7.5 billion (USD). Over the next few years, Algeria stood to receive over 600 combat aircraft, 22 bomber aircraft, 8 air defense systems, 2 submarines, tanks, 2 naval guns, over 4000 missiles,

and other arms from the Russian state arms exporter Rosoboronexport as part of a modernizing overhaul of Algeria's military capacity.

### 3.13. SERBIA

In addition to the information included in Table 2.4, think tanks indicate that Serbia is engaged in many more SALW deals with Africa. For example, in 2006 alone, Serbia sent:

4 million rounds of SALW rifle ammunition worth \$873,168 (USD) to Chad,

An unspecified amount of SALW and ammunition worth \$9.8million (USD) to both civilian and military end-users in Niger, and

Submachine guns, pistols, mines, ammunition, and grenade launchers, among other items, worth \$1million (USD) to Nigeria.

In 2006-2007, Serbia also sent unspecified amounts of machine guns and mortars to Liberia.

Table 2.4: Value of Defense Material Exports from Serbia (in US Dollars) from 2005-2007

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE	TYPE OF MATERIAL
Egypt	2007*	\$8,900,000	weapons and military equipment (licenses given out)
Libya	2006	\$11,500,000	weapons and military equipment (licenses given out)
Seychelles	2005	\$6,650,000	weapons and military equipment (licenses given out)
Uganda	2005	\$2,690,000	weapons and military equipment (licenses given out)

\* Although 10 licenses were issued at a value of \$8,900,000, the state's records indicate that only \$7,000,000(USD) was actually exported.

### 3.14. SWITZERLAND

In addition to the data in Table 2.5, Switzerland sent one (1) trainer aircraft to Chad in 2006, and made a deal with Nigeria in 2007 to export an unspecified amount of SALW in a deal worth 3165 Swiss Francs (CHF).

Table 2.5: Value of Military Weapon Exports from Switzerland (in Swiss Francs) from 2005-2009

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
Algeria	2009	985,000 CHF
Benin	2005	33,943 CHF
	2006	2,452 CHF
Botswana	2005	272,763 CHF
	2006	791,619 CHF
	2008	149,055 CHF

COUNTRY	YEAR	VALUE
	2009	1,360,028 CHF
Burkina Faso	2005	543 CHF
Cameroon	2005	985 CHF
	2006	1,530 CHF
	2008	1,180 CHF
Egypt	2005	1,494,442 CHF
	2006	3,226,797 CHF
	2007	1,066,229 CHF
	2008	30,960 CHF
	2009	399,889 CHF
Gabon	2009	2,595 CHF
Ghana	2008	838,750 CHF
Guinea	2009	6,200 CHF
Guinea-Bissau	2006	3,510 CHF
Kenya	2007	3,600 CHF
	2008	125,600 CHF
Libya	2005	4,871 CHF
Mali	2009	896 CHF
Namibia	2005	1,110 CHF
	2006	550 CHF
Niger	2005	19,401 CHF
	2006	13,361 CHF
	2007	3,165 CHF
	2008	1,582 CHF
	2009	5,214 CHF
South Africa	2005	723,629 CHF
	2006	359,269 CHF
	2007	1,065,471 CHF
	2008	663,458 CHF
	2009	2,211,774 CHF
Tanzania	2008	10,180 CHF
Tunisia	2005	140,466 CHF

### 3.15. UKRAINE

The official data reported in Table 2.6 does not begin to depict the amount of weapons actually exported from Ukraine to Africa. During the period of 2005 through 2009, Ukraine has exported and brokered deals for unlisted amounts of small arms and light weapons, as well as other military equipment, to the African continent. Such recipients include Ethiopia and Liberia. It is reported that although many of the Soviet-era stockpiles of weapons were officially supposed to be destroyed, there is a reluctance “in some quarters to destroy Kalashnikov rifles that could be sold to foreign customers” for a profit. This reluctance, combined with the lack of regulations and controls of Soviet-era weapons, have led to their proliferation to many conflict zones in Africa. The following are a few of such Ukrainian weapons exports reported by think tanks:

Over 75 long range missiles and 21 tanks to Algeria, between 2005 and 2007

3 combat helicopters, 6 ground attack aircraft, 12000 automatic rifles and submachine guns, 2 pistol/revolvers, 2 machine guns to Chad, between 2006-2007

1 combat helicopter to the Republic of Congo, in 2005

2 combat helicopters, 2 trainer aircraft, 4 ground attack aircraft to Equatorial Guinea, between 2007 and 2008

47 armored combat vehicles and 3 combat helicopters to Nigeria, between 2006-2008

1000 automatic rifles to Uganda, in 2007

At least 20 combat vehicles, 20 tanks, and other unspecified defense materials to the Democratic Republic of Congo, between 2005 and 2006

Table 2.6: Total Value of Defense Material Exports from Ukraine from 2006-2008

COUNTRY	YEAR(S)	AMOUNT AND TYPES OF MATERIALS
Chad	2006-2007	12000 automatic rifles and submachine guns
		at least 5 combat aircraft
	2008	88 armored personnel carriers
Kenya	2007	unspecified amount of ammunition
		40000 automatic rifles and submachine guns
Libya	2006-2007	405 grenade launchers
		101500 units exported, automatic rifles and submachine guns

### 3.16. TURKEY

In 2007, Turkey reportedly sent a shipment of small arms and light weapons, including 5 pistols/revolvers, to Ghana. Between 2007-2008, Turkey also sent 193 armed vehicles to Nigeria.

## 4. Some cases of dubious arms exports from Europe to Africa<sup>1</sup>

During the last 20 years EU Member States have developed a common framework to ensure their exports of military equipment will take into account political and moral concerns raised by their citizens. The Code of Conduct for European Union countries' exports of military technology and equipment was put into place in 1998. Ten years later the EU Code was transformed into a legally-binding Common Position. While the system represents a big improvement on transparency, the EU system is still far from perfect.

The Report "*Rhetoric or Restraint ? Trade in military equipment under the EU transfer control system*" (ed. An Vranckx, November 2010 [http://www.psw.ugent.be/crg/agenda/rhetoric%20or%20restraint\\_%20.pdf](http://www.psw.ugent.be/crg/agenda/rhetoric%20or%20restraint_%20.pdf) ) presents some cases of problematic exports, either because the country licensing authorities did not apply the rules with sufficient rigour; or mainly due to economic interests. The strong lobbying of weapons companies interested in selling military equipment of a certain magnitude create economic pressures that help to override the restrictive criteria of the EU Code/Common Position. In other cases different factors such as development, human rights and sub-regional stability, seem to come into play.

This section 4 (pp. 25 to 32) reproduces from the Report "Rhetoric or Restraint?" some of the problematic sales from EU to African countries that were approved or supported by EU Member State governments when there were good reasons under the EU criteria to refuse the deals. To maintain the simplicity of this document we do not mention the references that you can find in the Report "Rhetoric or Restraint ?<sup>2</sup>".

### 4.1. The military build-up in North-Africa<sup>3</sup>

Over the past few years Algeria and Morocco have signed a number of very large arms contracts, including fighter aircraft and major warships. Libya, with the EU arms embargo removed in 2004, is following suit. Smaller initial contracts are being followed up by much larger deals. There is a pattern of increased defence spending resembling a regional arms race.

Relations between Algeria and Morocco are difficult, in part due to the different positions with respect to the Sahara. The big arms sales to the three Maghreb countries risk fuelling a regional arms race that may actually worsen the security situation, the political and diplomatic relations in the region, with consequences for the wider region. All three countries have an abysmal record in terms of human rights.

Many EU Member States appear to justify arms trade with these countries with reference to EU or NATO cooperation programmes around migration control, piracy or anti-terrorism.

<b>Arms transfer agreements with Algeria, Libya and Morocco (2002-2009)</b>		
<b>Total value in millions current US\$<sup>4</sup></b>		
<b>Country</b>	<b>2002-2005</b>	<b>2006-2009</b>
Algeria	600	6,800
Libya	900	1,600
Morocco	700	4,700

<sup>1</sup> Pages 25 to 32 are reproduced and rearranged from the Report « Rhetoric or Restraint ? Trade in military equipment under the EU transfer control system. A Report to the EU Presidency. November 2010.;

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.psw.ugent.be/crg/agenda/rhetoric%20or%20restraint\\_%20.pdf](http://www.psw.ugent.be/crg/agenda/rhetoric%20or%20restraint_%20.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> Ibidem pp. 38 to 42.

<sup>4</sup> Figures in this table are sourced from Grimmert R, 'Conventional Arms Transfers to Developing Count

#### 4.1.1. Algeria

Algeria has agreed a US\$7.5 billion package deal with Russia, including 28 Su-30 jet fighters, 180 T-90 tanks, two submarines and several air defence systems. To sweeten the deal, Moscow forgave Algeria's US\$ 4.74 billion of Soviet-era debt<sup>5</sup>.

A similarly large deal has been won by Anglo-Italian helicopter manufacturer AgustaWestland which reportedly will supply up to 100 helicopters, worth up to US\$5 billion, to meet the country's "battlefield and internal security requirements". A number of European shipyards have negotiated to supply four stealth frigates, including technology transfers. The U.K. government signed a military cooperation accord with Algeria in October 2009, hoping it will spur further sales of helicopters and ships<sup>6</sup>.

#### 4.1.2. Morocco

Early 2008 Damen Schelde Naval Shipbuilding (Netherlands) won an order from the Moroccan government to build and design three Sigma-class frigates<sup>7</sup>. The Dutch export credit agency Atradius Dutch State Business agreed to insure the financial side of the deal<sup>8</sup>. An export licence worth €555 million was granted in September 2009. Reportedly the vessels would be needed for patrol and coast guard tasks and to enable joint operations with NATO navies. Armaments that include MICA and Exocet missiles (both supplied by European missile maker MBDA) and a 76mm Oto Melara canon however suggest more offensive capabilities as well. The Sigmas supplement two frigates bought from France in 2002<sup>9</sup>.

The deal is based on Morocco's aim to build closer military ties with both the EU and NATO. As part of the European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP), Morocco is bolstering security and military cooperation with the EU.

Military spending in Morocco is 3.4 per cent of GDP. In constant terms military spending rose from US\$1.4 billion in 2000 to US\$3.14 billion in 2009. There has been a US\$1 billion defence budget increase for both 2010 and 2011. As Morocco has no energy revenues it is said to have sought Saudi aid to cover some US\$3 billion of its procurement costs.

While the Dutch sale of frigates has been the largest European sale to Morocco, the North African country concluded a number of other big arms deals recently. French yard DCNS finalised a deal later in 2008 for one FREMM frigate, costing €470 million and to be delivered in 2013. The air force is modernising and expanding mostly through US-sourced weapons, such as Lockheed Martin F-16 aircraft and 24 Hawker Beechcraft T-6C Texan II aircraft, jointly worth over US\$1 billion. Meanwhile, ageing Mirage F1 fighters are being modernised by France for €350 million. Furthermore on order for the air force are four Italian/American C-27J Spartan transport aircraft worth an estimated US\$130 million, one Gulfstream 550 for the Air Force's 'VIP Squadron' (at US\$142 million), and three Boeing CH-47D Chinook transport helicopters, adding to nine older C model versions already in service, for an estimated US\$134 million.

#### 4.1.3. Libya

Back in 2004 the EU lifted its arms embargo partly under pressure from Italy which wanted "to supply Tripoli with surveillance equipment to help prevent illegal immigration. Italy's long coastline makes it a major target for African migrants trying to reach Europe by boat".

Libya's first major arms purchases have only recently been signed following the lifting of longstanding EU and UN arms embargoes in 2003/2004 after Tripoli declared to give up its weapons of mass destruction programmes. Russian Prime Minister Putin in early 2010 announced a US\$1.8 billion deal with Tripoli, reportedly including 12-20 Sukhoi fighter aircraft, six Yak-130 light combat aircraft, S-300 air defence systems and a Kalashnikov manufacturing facility.<sup>202</sup> In late 2007, France announced a preliminary agreement with Libya over a €4.5 billion arms package, including 10-14 Rafale fighters, 2 Gowong corvettes

---

<sup>5</sup> Carney D, 'Arming the Maghreb', ISN Security Watch, 17 November 2009; 'Algerian Arms Deal Brings Russia \$7.5 billion, Gas Market Leverage', Defense Industry Daily, 14 May 2009.

<sup>6</sup> Arezki Himeur M and Gelfand L, 'UK signs accord with Algeria in pursuit of sales', Jane's Defence Weekly, 4 November 2009.

<sup>7</sup> 'The Royal Moroccan Navy Orders Three Sigma Class Frigates', Damen News, 20 February 2008.

<sup>8</sup> <[http://www.atradiusdutchstatebusiness.nl/Images/EKVpolissen2008\\_tcm1008-130101.pdf](http://www.atradiusdutchstatebusiness.nl/Images/EKVpolissen2008_tcm1008-130101.pdf)>

<sup>9</sup> Jane's Sentinel Security Assessment - North Africa.

and 8-12 Tiger attack helicopters, among many more items.<sup>203</sup> No firm contract has so far been signed though. However it appears that Paris has delivered 100 MILAN-3 anti-tank missiles to Tripoli in 2009, in a deal worth €168 million. Dassault is also said to be working on the overhaul of Mirage fighter aircraft.

The biggest military-related deal with an EU Member State to date has been a €300 million contract with Italy's Finmeccanica signed with Libya in late 2009. Finmeccanica and AgustaWestland – each for 25 per cent - have also created joint venture LIATEC (Libyan Italian Advanced Technology Company) with the Libyan Company for Aviation Industry; it hopes to use it as leverage to win orders from the Libyan air force. LIATEC has already done upgrades for at least three Chinook helicopters. Spanish company ITP has signed a contract to service and repair Libyan C-130 Hercules transport aircraft. The UK has issued arms export licences for Libya since at least 2007, including water cannons for riot control and internal security. According to the UK Strategic Export Controls annual report of 2008 this happened despite “concerns with Libya's human rights record”. Relaxing the rules to accommodate Libya in this case is wrong”. However the DSO export promotion organization had made Tripoli a prime target for UK arms transfers.

Human rights organisations in Belgium in 2009 successfully challenged a €11.5 million transaction of small arms to Libya, with the Council of State concluding that a transitional government could not grant export licences, but also noting that the weapons could be used for human rights violations and would risk diversion. However, soon after, the new government granted a new export licence, with negotiations pending for new exports up to €111 million over five years.

#### **4.2. French arms transfers to Chad**

Chad is one of the poorest and least stable countries in the world, with internal and external armed conflicts, with no proper democratic system in place, and with a UN panel recently naming the Chad Government as in breach of an embargo. Yet according to SIPRI, Chad's defence budget exploded from 1 per cent of GDP around 2004 to 6.6 per cent in 2008; from US\$71 million in 2005 to US\$611 million in 2008. In 2009, as oil prices fell, military spending fell back to US\$412 million.

French arms exports to Chad, have been worth more than the amount Chad has dedicated to, for example, combating child mortality and AIDS. In such circumstances, it would seem sensible for EU Member States to exercise extreme caution with regard to supplying Chad with military equipment. This is the case for most EU states. But France has been Chad's main EU arms supplier in recent years, supplying most notably armoured vehicles, but also ammunition, trucks and aircraft. The role of Belgium in the supply of the armoured vehicles raises questions. Transactions authorised have included the re-transfer of 82 ex-South African, armoured vehicles armed with 90mm light weapons, which were refurbished in Belgium.

A contract for 82 AML-90 armoured vehicles, built under licence in South Africa as Eland-90, was signed on 5 September 2006 by Chadian President Deby and a South African company. Eland vehicles had been transferred from South Africa to Belgium in 1999 and 2002 respectively, reported by South Africa to the UN register of conventional arms. Their submission reads that the sale was to “End User: SABILEX”, which it would seem reasonable to presume refers in fact to the Belgian defence contractor SABIEX. France reported to the UN register a 2007 transfer of 40 armoured combat vehicles to Chad, plus the export in 2008 of 25 armoured personnel vehicles. It remains unclear why France did not report the transfer of the 42 Elands to Chad. The transferred vehicles were destined directly for the fight against Chadian rebels.

France has acknowledged that it facilitated emergency supplies of ammunition from Libya to Chad in February 2008, when rebels were fighting in the capital. In 2009 Renault Trucks received orders for 116 trucks from the Chadian MoD, with the company noting that the “new contract is important for Renault Trucks Defense in this troubled area of Africa”. The Singapore office of Eurocopter – the predominantly French helicopter branch of EADS – started delivering to Chad the first three of six refurbished ex-Singaporean Air Force Fennec helicopters in late 2009. Most recently it was reported that two ex-French armed forces EMB-312 Tucano aircraft – originally built by Brazilian company Embraer – are being prepared for delivery to the Chadian air force.

Table 7: Value of granted export licences by EU Member States to Chad (2005 – 2008, in €)<sup>10</sup>.

Country	2005	2006	2007	2008	2005-2008
Bulgaria				2 042 965	2 042 965
Czech Rep	4 000				4 000
Denmark		25 606			25 606
France	2 678 756	3 395 801	3 506 969	12 979 250	22 560 776
Greece				11 780	11 780
Portugal	23 743		609 843	452 334	1 085 920
U.K.			344 400	261 800	606 200
<b>TOTAL</b>	2 706 499	3 421 407	4 461 212	15 748 129	26 337 247

Most EU Member States have followed a restrictive policy towards Chad, which can be seen from the limited number of supplying countries, as well as denied export licences: 13 between 2005 and 2008, with 51 licences granted. France has been the exception, granting export licences worth €22.5 million from 2005-2008, out of a total value of €26.3 million by all EU Member States as reported in the EU Consolidated Reports on those years.

### **4.3. Bulgarian attack helicopters for Mali**

For decades Mali has been one of the world's poorest countries and among the least developed. Life expectancy is 48.1 years on average and Mali has the world's lowest adult literacy rate at 26.2 per cent. Mali has been the stage of a series of confrontations with Tuareg rebels, the last between 2007- 2009.

In early April 2008 two Malian Mi-24s armed helicopters attacked Tuareg rebel positions near Kidal in the Sahara, during which dozens of rebel fighters were killed or wounded in the attack, the first of its kind in the conflict. 62 people were killed in the fighting.

From its surplus stocks Bulgaria sold four Mi-24D 'Hind' attack helicopters to Mali that were delivered between mid-2007 and November 2009. Moreover Bulgaria supplied 78 armoured combat vehicles. According to the EU's consolidated reports of the years concerned Bulgaria issued export licences for Mali worth a total €13.8 million in the years 2007 and 2008. Figures of 2009, which are not yet available, are likely to include more licences as the last two Mi-24s were only delivered in late November 2009. SIPRI's database reports a €5.7 million value for the sale of these two Mi-24s. Bulgaria has almost been Mali's sole arms supplier over the past years, apart from a 2005 Czech transfer of three surplus Mi-21 fighter aircraft.

Bulgaria reported to the UN's Arms Register the 2008 transfer to Mali of 15 BRDM plus 14 BTR armoured combat vehicles "without armaments"; in 2007 it reported another 20 armoured "reconnaissance

<sup>10</sup> EUFOR TCJAD/RCA webpage at <http://www.consilium.europa.eu/showPage.aspx?id=136>

vehicles”, plus two Mi-24Ds. Bulgaria also reported the 2009 Mi-24 deliveries. Mali itself has never reported any arms imports to the UN Register. The transfer of four ex-Bulgarian Mi-24 attack helicopters to Mali has significantly strengthened Mali’s air force adding a new attack capability to an inventory of only five much smaller utility/transport type helicopters. The Mi-24 attack helicopter is equipped with a 23mm or 30mm twin-barrel gun and can launch missiles from six underwing pylons. The Bulgarian Mi-24 transfers raise serious questions because these exports were either fulfilled or agreed at a time the Malian armed forces were fighting a Tuareg rebellion, secondly the first two helicopters were used in combat shortly after their delivery, but before the other two were transferred.

In May 2009, Algiers provided Bamako with military equipment ahead of a Malian army operation against an AQIM base in northern Mali. Also US troops have been training Malian armed forces in counter-insurgency operations from a base in Tombuktu since 2003, including the delivery of supplies of 4WDs, communications and radar equipment.

Because of economic growth Mali’s military expenditure has been relatively stable around 2 per cent of GDP over the past decade. However, in real (2008 US\$) terms it has significantly grown from 117 million in 2002 to US\$182 million in 2009.

#### **4.4. EU companies and clandestine shipments to Sudan**

Companies based or registered in two EU countries - the UK and Germany - played an important role in facilitating clandestine shipments of military equipment to Southern Sudan in 2007-2008. Tanks, artillery, multiple rockets launch systems, rocket propelled grenades and assault rifles were sent to the government of Southern Sudan, via illicit diversion through Kenya. These transfers risk fuelling armed conflict and serious violations of international human rights and humanitarian law, but may also have breached existing EU embargoes, which have been in place for the whole of Sudan since 1994.

Many governments, including the UK, the USA and Germany, were seemingly aware that these deals were of a clandestine nature and were likely being diverted from Kenya by road and rail to armed forces in Southern Sudan. Despite such knowledge, EU Member States appear to have failed to meet their obligations to help prevent serious breaches of existing EU sanctions via companies operating within their jurisdictions.

The 20-year Sudanese civil war (1983-2003) was a brutal conflict, which left at least two million people dead and displaced a further four million from their homes. Serious human rights abuses were committed by all sides in the conflict, including the deliberate targeting of civilians, forced conscription, the use of child soldiers, ‘scorched-earth’ policies and blocking the delivery of food aid. The use of heavy weaponry, including indiscriminate shelling and bombing of civilian areas was a key feature of the conflict. Civilians are still being killed and abducted as a result of ongoing clashes between armed communities, militias and military units in the region with weapons continuing to be used to fuel serious human rights violations. Between May and June 2008, forces from both sides initiated direct conflict in the provincial capital, Abyei, displacing an estimated 50,000 people. In February 2009, clashes between SAF and SPLA contingents of the Joint Integrated Units stationed in Malakal, southern Sudan, reportedly left around 62 dead (at least 31 of whom were civilians) and 94 wounded (at least 21 of whom were civilians), according to UN reports. UN military observers stated that both SAF and SPLA forces used main battle tanks and small arms in the fighting. Both sides used tanks to launch their attacks.

Any non-declared import of weaponry to South Sudan is a violation of the Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) signed in 2005 by the Sudan Government and the authorities of South Sudan **which** was brokered in large part by Kenya. According the CPA’s implementing procedures, signed at Naivasha, Kenya on 31st December 2004, “replenishment of ammunition, weapons and other lethal or military equipment” would violate the terms of the CPA unless it had been approved via a joint military committee and under the oversight and coordination of the UN mission in Sudan.

Significant quantities of arms have also been supplied to the Government of North Sudan in recent years, particularly from China and Russia which have fuelled killings and grave human rights violations in the Darfur region and elsewhere. In the run-up to the long-awaited referendum in February 2011 on the possible secession of the South, it is clear that large scale re-arming by North and South Sudan is likely to

re-ignite major armed conflict which clearly risks indiscriminate attacks on civilians and other serious violations of international human rights and humanitarian law.

#### **4.4.1. Ukrainian weapons and Southern Sudan**

In September 2008, a Ukrainian-operated ship, the MV Faina, bound for Mombasa (Kenya), was hijacked by Somali pirates. The Faina was carrying a large cargo of artillery, small arms and T-72 tanks loaded at Oktyabrsk (Ukraine). There had been widespread speculation, including a public statement from the US Navy's 5th Fleet in the Indian Ocean, that the cargo on board was destined not for the Kenyan Armed Forces, but for the Government of Southern Sudan (GOSS). This was denied by the Kenyan Ministry of Defence, which claimed that 'GOSS' stood for a (previously unheard of) department within the Kenyan Ministry of Defence called 'General Ordinance Supply and Security'.

Documents have since come to light, including shipping manifests, charter documents and a Ukrainian export permit, showing that the MV Faina's cargo was only one of at least three major maritime arms shipments since September 2007, fulfilling at least three arms contracts, with 'MOD/GOSS' contract numbers, signed with a Ukrainian arms exporter, SSSFTF 'Ukrinmash', on 29 December 2006 and 15 February 2007 respectively. The first contract included ZU-23-2 (23mm) and ZPU-4 (14.5mm) anti-aircraft guns; BM-21 'Grad' 122mm multiple launch rocket systems, mounted on URAL trucks; RPG-7V rocket-propelled grenades; and at least 5 containers full of AKM assault rifles. The second contract consisted of T-72M1 and T-72M1K (command version) main battle tanks, along with spare parts, tools and accessories. The third contract included 13,926 rounds of 125mm tank ammunition, suitable for T-72 tanks.

Reports made by Ukraine to the UN Register of Conventional Arms (UNRCA) in 2007 and 2008 show exports of 110 T-72 Tanks to Kenya, which is likely to represent the total number of tanks exported as part of these contracts.<sup>339</sup> To date, the Kenyan authorities have only acknowledged delivery of the 33 tanks and other weapons from the MV Faina and not the previous two unreported shipments and their contents.

That currently leaves 77 T-72 tanks and the other items of heavy weaponry, artillery systems and small arms and light weapons unaccounted for by the Kenyan authorities. Kenya has also failed to submit any returns to the UNRCA showing the import of any heavy weaponry from Ukraine.

The two previous shipments arrived in the port of Mombasa in October 2007 and January 2008. The first arrived on board the MV Radomyshl, which departed from the Ukrainian port of Oktyabrsk on 14 September 2007 and arrived in Mombasa, Kenya, on 29th October 2007.<sup>340</sup> The Radomyshl was operated by the Danube Shipping Company of the Ukraine (UDASCO), but was 'time chartered',<sup>341</sup> more particularly by a UK-registered company Marine Energy Trading Company Ltd (METCO).<sup>342</sup> It has not been possible to determine the controlling ownership of METCO: the charter contract was arranged by two Latvian-based consultants, representing two British Virgin Islands-registered companies whose ownership is kept secret under BVI law.

The second shipment arrived on board the German-operated MV Beluga Endurance, which departed Oktyabrsk on 12 December 2007 and arrived in Mombasa on 12 January 2008. The Beluga Endurance was operated by German company Beluga Shipping GmbH, but Time Chartered by Ace Shipping Ltd of the Isle of Man, closely associated with Ukrainian company Phoenix Transport Services.

A spokesperson for Phoenix Transport Services told researchers that "the only reason of using Ace Shipping Co during the vessel's chartering is the simplification of accounting, as the Ukrainian tax legislation is one of the most complicated in the world".

Representatives from Beluga Shipping told researchers the original charter was to move "general construction equipment" from Ukraine to Kenya and not military equipment. On arriving at Oktyabrsk and on discovering that the consignment was in fact a large array of weapons and munitions, immediate enquires were made to relevant government departments in Germany and they were informed that it was likely these arms were bound for South Sudan.

According to Beluga Shipping, despite an EU embargo and clear concerns over the nature of this cargo, the German authorities did not make any request to stop the delivery.

This and other research has highlighted a current deficiency in German export controls on transportation which appear to only cover German-flagged ships, but not ships which are owned or operated by German firms, but are foreign flagged in other Jurisdictions. In this case, the Beluga Endurance, while operated by a Germany company was flagged in Antigua and Barbuda.<sup>346</sup>

Evidence that Ukrainian tanks were diverted to Southern Sudan Compelling evidence, including analysis of satellite imagery, triangulated with eye witness testimony and interviews with military sources close to the SPLA in Southern Sudan also strongly suggests that the weapons delivered on the MV Radymshyl and the MV Beluga Endurance were clandestinely transferred by road and rail through Kenya via the town of Lokichoggio on the Kenya/Sudan border. For example, eyewitnesses described a series of night time convoys of low load vehicles in late 2007 and February 2008 with tanks clearly visible either under tarpaulin sheets or plywood coverings: dates corresponding to the arrival of these two shipments.<sup>347</sup> Further eyewitnesses reported seeing tanks matching the description of explosive-reactive-armoured T-72s in early 2009 in two locations around Juba in southern Sudan. One military source close to the SPLA described to a researcher in some detail the political and military considerations of the purchase of these weapons following a visit by then SPLA Chief of Staff Lt Gen. Oyei Deng Ajak and other senior SPLA officers to Ukraine in early 2006. In July 2009, Jane's Defence Weekly published a series of satellite imagery showing for the first time, photographic evidence of newly delivered tanks in SPLA bases near Juba in Southern Sudan.<sup>348</sup> One image captured on 17 May 2009 clearly showed the presence of 12 new tracked vehicles with a size ratio consistent with T-72 tanks and much larger than the older T-55/Type 59 tanks that were previously used by SPLA forces.<sup>349</sup> Analysis of satellite images taken from Kahawa barracks outside Nairobi, Kenya, in March 2009 clearly show the presence of 33 T-72 tanks that were offloaded from the MV Faina. A comparison of the images taken from Kahawa and Juba clearly show that the vehicles are of the same dimensions and shape,<sup>350</sup> and further indicate that at least some of the first two shipments of T-72 tanks were indeed delivered to Southern Sudan. Finally, in July 2009 an SPLA spokesperson, while denying that the Faina's cargo was theirs, confirmed publicly to Jane's Defence Weekly in late May 2009 that the SPLA had acquired T-72 tanks "since last year and some even earlier".<sup>351</sup>

## Conclusions

Sudan has been subject to a comprehensive EU arms embargo since 1994. The involvement of the UK and German companies raises serious concerns about EU governments' ability and willingness to implement and enforce this embargo as well as provisions contained within the EU common position relating to armed conflict, diversion and violations of human rights and international humanitarian law. Improvements in EU export controls are needed to better regulate companies involved in the transport of arms to destinations where there is a substantial risk the arms will be used for violations of human rights. As stipulated in the 2007 UN Panel of Experts report on arms brokers, EU controls on arms brokering activities should be strengthened to include controls over closely associated activities such as transportation, freight forwarding, brokering and handling agents. To avoid jurisdiction based loopholes, it is vital that controls apply to all companies based, operating or registered in EU countries, as they already do for some categories of weapons in the UK, for example.<sup>352</sup>

Several governments appear to have had strong intelligence that suggested a large scale and clandestine delivery of weapons to Southern Sudan.

This includes a public statement by the USA, and information apparently passed to the German government by a transport provider during the shipments. A further transport services provider involved in the shipments who told researchers that the shipments were destined for Southern Sudan, acts as a consular official for a European government.<sup>353</sup> It is clear that credible intelligence is a key tool in the risk assessment process and in wider efforts to stop weapons deliveries that risk contributing to grave breaches of international law. In this case, German authorities made no attempts to intervene and stop weapons being delivered by a German shipping company, despite being consulted by the company prior to departure from the Ukraine.

This research has provided further evidence of the role that "shell" or "brass plate" companies play in facilitating clandestine arms deliveries. Given that the EU is at the forefront in efforts to curb illicit arms

proliferation, it is of serious concern that such companies can easily register in EU jurisdictions without any efforts by EU governments to investigate or prosecute these companies even when their involvement in illicit arms deals come to light.<sup>354</sup> There should be greater regulatory oversight, including a registering of all arms brokers and ancillary services, and more rigorous company registration and vetting process for any EU company wishing to trade in conventional weapons.

#### **4.5. South Africa**

Andrew Feinstein in his book *“After the Party: Corruption, the ANC and South Africa’s Uncertain Future”* shows the disastrous consequences for South Africa’s development and transparency of an arms deal between the ANC and five EU governments and their companies. Andrew Feinstein is a former ANC Member of Parliament who resigned after being stopped from investigating the arms deal.

In late 1998, early 1999 South Africa’s government spent over €4.5 billion on arms that the country didn’t need and barely uses. Over €200 million of bribes were paid to senior politicians, officials, middlemen and the ANC ruling party. The bribes were a key motivator in the deal. The deal violated at least two criteria of the EU’s Common Position and has had a heavy cost for South Africa in socio-economic development and even greater was the damage wrought to the country’s democratic institutions and the rule of law.

The procurement process was fatally flawed, with the most expensive contract being awarded for a jet that didn’t make the original short-list and that the Air Force stated publicly they didn’t want. It was two and a half times the price of the preferred jet, but the company paid more than €100 million in bribes.

The agreement was signed at a time when then President Mbeki claimed the country lacked the fiscal resources to provide life-saving medication to the almost 6 million people living with HIV/AIDS, leading to at least 355,000 avoidable deaths. The deal has, and will continue (until the contracts’ conclusion in 2018) to reduce South Africa’s GDP by anything between 0.1 and 0.5 of a per cent p.a. in an economic environment with more than 25 per cent formal unemployment. This money could have funded, not only the life-saving medication, but also approximately 33,000 new schools staffed with fully trained teachers, 2 million new houses or 100,000 new jobs for a decade.

# GENERAL SOURCES

## Organizations:

Group for Research and Information on Peace and Security (GRIP). <http://www.grip-publications.eu>.

International Action Network on Small Arms (IANSA). [www.iansa.org](http://www.iansa.org).

Ploughshares Fund. [www.ploughshares.org](http://www.ploughshares.org).

South Eastern and Eastern Europe Clearinghouse for the Control of Small Arms and Light Weapons (SEESAC). [www.seesac.org](http://www.seesac.org).

Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI). [www.sipri.org](http://www.sipri.org).

## Publications:

“African Arms Imports Share Up.” SIPRI. March 2010.

Armaments, Disarmament, and International Security. SIPRI Yearbooks 2005-2008.

“Eleventh Annual Report according to Article 8(2) of Council Common Position 2008/944/CFSP defining common rules governing control of exports of military technology and equipment...” *Official Journal of the European Union: Information and Notices*. Vol. 52. November 2009.

Holtom, Paul. “Ukrainian Exports of Small Arms and Light Weapons, 2004-2007.” SIPRI Background Paper. October 2008.

Tica Font & Francesc Benitez, Spanish Arms Exports: 1999-2008, Centre d’Estudis per la Pau J.M. Delàs (Justicia i Pau: Barcelona, March 2010)

Wezeman, Pieter D. “Arms Flows to the Conflict in Chad.” SIPRI Background Paper. August 2009.

Wezeman, Pieter D. “Arms Transfers to Central, North, and West Africa.” SIPRI Background Paper. April 2009.

Wezeman Pieter D. “Arms Transfers to East and Southern Africa.” SIPRI Background Paper. December 2009.

## National Reports:

“Annual Report on Export Control for 2007 and 2008.” Republic of Albania Ministry of Defense, Albanian State Export Control Authority.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Sep. 2003 to 31 Dec. 2005.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jan. 2006 to 30 Jun. 2006.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jul. 2006 to 31 Dec. 2006.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jan. 2007 to 30 Jun. 2007.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jul. 2007 to 31 Dec. 2007.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jan. 2008 to 30 Jun. 2008.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jul. 2008 to 31 Dec. 2008.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jan. 2009 to 30 Jun. 2009.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report to Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 1 Jul. 2009 to 31 Dec. 2009.” Government of Belgium, Department of Foreign Affairs.

“Report from the Brussels Government Concerning the Import, Export, and Transit of Military Goods: Period 1 Jan. 2005 to 31 Dec. 2005.”

“Report from the Brussels Government Concerning the Import, Export, and Transit of Military Goods: Period 1 Jan. 2006 to 31 Dec. 2006.”

“Report from the Brussels Government Concerning the Import, Export, and Transit of Military Goods: Period 1 Jan. 2007 to 31 Dec. 2007.”

“Report from the Brussels Government Concerning the Import, Export, and Transit of Military Goods: Period 1 Jan. 2008 to 30 Jun. 2008.”

“Report from the Brussels Government Concerning the Import, Export, and Transit of Military Goods: Period 1 Jul. 2008 to 31 Dec. 2008.”

“Report from the Flemish Government on Licenses for the Import, Export, and Transit of Weapons: Period 1 Jan. 2005 to 31 Dec. 2005.”

“Report from the Flemish Government on Licenses for the Import, Export, and Transit of Weapons: Period 1 Jan. 2006 to 31 Dec. 2006.”

“Report from the Flemish Government on Licenses for the Import, Export, and Transit of Weapons: Period 1 Jan. 2007 to 31 Dec. 2007.”

“Report from the Flemish Government on Licenses for the Import, Export, and Transit of Weapons: Period 1 Jan. 2008 to 31 Dec. 2008.”

“Report from the Flemish Government on Licenses for the Import, Export, and Transit of Weapons: Period 1 Jan. 2009 to 31 Dec. 2009.”

“Report to the Wallonian Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 2005.”

“Report to the Wallonian Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 2006.”

“Report to the Wallonian Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 2007.”

“Report to the Wallonian Parliament According to the Law on the Importation, Exportation, and Transit of Arms: 2008.”

“Annual Arms Exports and Imports Report: Information on Licenses Issued for Brokering of Arms, Military Equipment, and Dual-Use Products in 2007.” Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Relations.

“Information on Licenses Issued for Transfers of Arms, Military Equipment, and Dual-Use Products in 2008.” Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Relations.

“Annual Report on the Czech Republic’s Control of Exports of Military Equipment and Small Arms for Civilian Use in the Czech Republic – 2005.” Czech Republic, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Annual Report on the Czech Republic’s Control of Exports of Military Equipment and Small Arms for Civilian Use in the Czech Republic – 2006.” Czech Republic, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Annual Report on the Czech Republic’s Control of Exports of Military Equipment and Small Arms for Civilian Use in the Czech Republic – 2007.” Czech Republic, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Annual Report on the Czech Republic’s Control of Exports of Military Equipment and Small Arms for Civilian Use in the Czech Republic – 2008.” Czech Republic, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Strategic Goods Commission Activity Report: Year 2005.” Government of Estonia, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Strategic Goods Commission Activity Report: Year 2006.” Government of Estonia, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Strategic Goods Commission Activity Report: Year 2007.” Government of Estonia, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Strategic Goods Commission Activity Report: Year 2008.” Government of Estonia, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

“Annual Report According to the EU Code of Conduct on Arms Exports National Report of Finland for 2005.” Government of Finland, Ministry of Defense.

“Annual Report According to the EU Code of Conduct on Arms Exports National Report of Finland for 2006.” Government of Finland, Ministry of Defense.

“Annual Report According to the EU Code of Conduct on Arms Exports National Report of Finland for 2007.” Government of Finland, Ministry of Defense.

“Annual Report According to the EU Code of Conduct on Arms Exports National Report of Finland for 2008.” Government of Finland, Ministry of Defense.

“Rapport Au Parlement: Les Exportations d’Armement de la France en 2005.” Government of France, Ministry of Defense.

“Rapport Au Parlement: Les Exportations d’Armement de la France en 2006.” Government of France, Ministry of Defense.

“Rapport Au Parlement: Les Exportations d’Armement de la France en 2007.” Government of France, Ministry of Defense.

“Rapport Au Parlement: Les Exportations d’Armement de la France en 2008.” Government of France, Ministry of Defense.

“2005 Military Equipment Report.” Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology.

“2006 Military Equipment Report.” Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology.

“2007 Military Equipment Report.” Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology.

“2008 Military Equipment Report.” Government of the Federal Republic of Germany, Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology.

“Annual Arms Export Report, 2005.” Republic of Macedonia.

“Annual Arms Export Report, 2007.” Republic of Macedonia.

“Annual Report on Import and Export of Controlled Goods in 2006.” The Republic of Montenegro, Ministry for Economic Development.

“Annual Report on Foreign Trade in Controlled Goods in 2007.” The Republic of Montenegro, Ministry for Economic Development.

“Annual Report on Foreign Trade in Controlled Goods in 2008.” The Republic of Montenegro, Ministry of Economy.

"Annual Report on The Netherlands Arms Export Policy: 2005." Government of The Netherlands, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

"Annual Report on The Netherlands Arms Export Policy: 2006." Government of The Netherlands, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

"Annual Report on The Netherlands Arms Export Policy: 2007." Government of The Netherlands, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

"Annual Report on The Netherlands Arms Export Policy: 2008." Government of The Netherlands, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

"Export of Defense Material from Norway in 2007, Export Control and International Non-Proliferation Cooperation." Government of Norway, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

"Annual Arms Exports and Imports Report: Information on Licenses Issued for Brokering of Arms, Military Equipment, and Dual-Use Products in 2006." Bosnia and Herzegovina, Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Relations.

"Relatório Annual de Importações e Exportações de Bens e Tecnologias Militares: Ano de 2007." Government of Portugal, Ministry of National Defense.

"Relatório Annual de Importações e Exportações de Bens e Tecnologias Militares: Ano de 2008." Government of Portugal, Ministry of National Defense.

"Arms Export Controls: Annual Report January-December 2006." Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Romania, National Agency for Export Controls.

"Arms Export Controls: Annual Report January-December 2007." Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Romania, National Agency for Export Controls.

"Annual Report on the Realization of Foreign Trade Transfers of Controlled Goods for 2005 and 2006." Republic of Serbia, Ministry of Economy and Regional Development.

"Annual Report on the Transfers of Controlled Goods in 2007." Republic of Serbia, Ministry of Economy and Regional Development, Sector of Foreign Trade Regime and Policy.

"Slovenia Arms Export/Import Report: 2006." Slovenian Ministry of Defense.

"Slovenia Arms Export/Import Report: 2007." Slovenian Ministry of Defense.

"Slovenia Arms Export/Import Report: 2008." Slovenian Ministry of Defense.

"Slovenia Arms Export/Import Report: 2009." Slovenian Ministry of Defense.

"Spanish Export Statistics Regarding Defense Material, Other Materials, and Dual-Use Items and Technologies, 2006." Government of Spain, Ministry of Industry, Tourism, and Trade.

"Spanish Export Statistics Regarding Defense Material, Other Materials, and Dual-Use Items and Technologies, 2007." Government of Spain, Ministry of Industry, Tourism, and Trade.

"Spanish Export Statistics Regarding Defense Material, Other Materials, and Dual-Use Items and Technologies, 2008." Government of Spain, Ministry of Industry, Tourism, and Trade.

"Strategic Export Control in 2005 – Military Equipment and Dual-Use Products." National Inspectorate of Strategic Products (ISP).

"Strategic Export Control in 2006 – Military Equipment and Dual-Use Products." National Inspectorate of Strategic Products (ISP).

"Strategic Export Control in 2007 – Military Equipment and Dual-Use Products." National Inspectorate of Strategic Products (ISP).

"Strategic Export Control in 2008 – Military Equipment and Dual-Use Products." National Inspectorate of Strategic Products (ISP).

“Exportations de Matériel de Guerre: 2005.” Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

“Exportations de Matériel de Guerre: 2006.” Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

“Exportations de Matériel de Guerre: 2007.” Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

“Exportations de Matériel de Guerre: 2008.” Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

“Exportations de Matériel de Guerre: 2009.” Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

“United Kingdom Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report 2005.” United Kingdom Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

“United Kingdom Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report 2006.” United Kingdom Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

“United Kingdom Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report 2007.” United Kingdom Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

“United Kingdom Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report 2008.” United Kingdom Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

“United Kingdom Strategic Export Controls: Annual Report 2009.” United Kingdom Foreign and Commonwealth Office.